



## Bratenahl Strategic Master Plan

Public Review Draft: November 18, 2013

**Contents**

I. Letter to Residents of Bratenahl and Their Elected Officials.....Page 3

II. Executive Summary: A Call to Action.....Page 4

III. Planning Process.....Page 9

IV. Community Planning Priorities.....Page 12

V. Existing Conditions Overview.....Page 25

## *I. Letter To the Residents of Bratenahl and Their Elected Officials*

Since April 2013, a citizen advisory team, supported by a consulting team of professional planners, has been working on a new strategic master plan for the Village of Bratenahl. The plan identifies the most important priorities for improving our community and keeping Bratenahl vital in the future. It is a coordinated, integrated and actionable citizen-led plan that embodies residents' ideas shared during the planning process.

The plan provides a community investment and development framework, with valuable tools and strategies to help guide future decision-making by our elected officials and their staff members. The plan document summarizes existing community conditions, examines key issues facing the community, sets priorities, and identifies short, intermediate, and long term strategies addressing these priorities.

Funding for the strategic master plan was provided by the Cuyahoga County Department of Development Municipal Grant Program, which originates from the Community Development Block Grant Program. Cuyahoga County Government provides planning funds to communities with the steadfast belief that good planning is critically important to community development.

The Master Plan Steering Committee wishes to thank Mayor John Licastro and Village Council Members: Laura Bacci, Mary Beckenbach, Bill Bolton, Andy Kesselem, Marla Murphy, and Paul Stephan for their leadership and support. We sincerely thank the many residents who actively participated in the planning process and our consultants, Environmental Design Group (EDG). Finally, we wish to thank our external partners, including Cuyahoga County Government, the Cleveland Division of Fire and Emergency Services, the Northeast Ohio Regional Sewer District, and the Cleveland City Planning Commission for their involvement and support.

### **Strategic Master Plan Committee**

Janis Purdy, Chair  
Laura Bacci  
Vikki Broer  
Cassandra Collier-Williams  
Don Iannone  
Trevor Jones  
John Licastro  
Tom McDonald  
Erin Smith  
Leslie Yerkes

## *II. Executive Summary: A Call to Action*

Bratenahl has a rich and interesting history as a small lakefront residential community. The community has fared far better than most Cuyahoga County communities because of its prominent and engaged residents. The community has been well maintained by its residents and Village Government. The Village's community's success in the past is a result of the vision and resources of its residents, who until recently have not needed formal, ongoing community planning to keep the community healthy.

Bratenahl is an aging community from the standpoint of demographics, housing stock and public infrastructure. It must attract new younger residents to replace those it is losing. It must keep its residential base strong through ongoing renovation and maintenance. It must invest in its infrastructure to ensure it supports the community in the future. The community's financial resources have been strong in the past but could weaken in the future as the community's revenue base becomes more constrained and as community investment needs grow. We must also be aware of continued reduction of revenue to local governments from Ohio's General Assembly.

Over time, the community's surrounding area has become increasingly important to the health and stability of Bratenahl. The Village must work in partnership with the surrounding Cleveland neighborhoods to keep Bratenahl healthy. Surrounding area influences, both good and bad, will grow stronger and have a greater impact on Bratenahl. This underscores the importance of new partnerships with surrounding communities.

Considering its finite resources, Bratenahl must tackle four pressing challenges to keep the community vital in the future:

- Strengthen government and community capacity, especially its financial resource base.
- Invest in its built residential, public facilities and infrastructure base to continue to grow property values and bring new revenues to the community.
- Continue to protect its natural resource base.
- Market the Village and attract appropriate new development and new residents.

This Strategic Master Plan recommends the following community actions to marshal public and private resources to meet these four community challenges. Importantly, the Strategic Master Plan Steering Committee will continue to meet quarterly to review and report to Village residents on the status and progress of the plan's implementation and impact.

### *Government & Governance - Strengthen Planning, Management and Finances*

This planning priority addresses the need for fiscal sustainability and building community capacity. It is recognized by community leaders that some of the historic revenue sources the community has used in the past to provide services have been reduced or eliminated. In addition, larger economic and demographic changes have and will continue to have a financial impact to the Village. We must recognize the

level of financial investment required for the Village to continue to offer quality services to its residents. In the future, Village Government must engage in sound financial stewardship and more systematic financial planning, including the preparation of short and longer term revenue and expense projections.

***Government and Governance Action Items:***

- Adopt, implement and monitor progress on achieving the actions recommended in the strategic master plan.
- Develop and implement a community investment strategy that ensures Bratenahl has the public and private sector resources needed to accomplish its top plan priorities.
- Improve teamwork and cooperation within Village Government to provide the leadership and staffing required to implement the plan.

***Built Environment - Strengthen Bratenahl's Built Environment***

Through the public engagement efforts, residents noted the importance of maintaining the current quality of housing stock and choices. Bratenahl is well known for its beautiful and historic residential estates from Cleveland's industrial age as well as well-crafted newer homes. Our side streets add to the diversity of our housing stock with single family homes, many of which were built in the 1920s and 1940s. While the community is mostly built-out, residents and stakeholders indicated that there is a desire to identify opportunities for select targeted development and/or redevelopment. The use of current public buildings and land needed for development and redevelopment also needs to be assessed for the condition and use of the facility as well as its current and potential use.

***Built Environment Action Items***

***Improve Public Facilities:***

- Conduct a public facilities assessment by engaging the services of an architect or other professional to conduct an inventory of the three Village buildings as to current condition of use, future required maintenance and frequency of use.
- Study the costs and benefits of acquisition of the Barbara Byrd Bennett Professional Development Center from the Cleveland Municipal School District. If significantly beneficial, then attempt to ascertain the likeliness of purchasing this property, a potential timeline for the acquisition, and estimated cost. This type of information is needed to help make decisions on the other public buildings within the Village.
- Request the Mayor and Council to evaluate options for future use of public buildings with and without the acquisition of the Bennett Building and associated cost.
- Engage in discussion with the public financial experts, including the Village's Bond Counsel, about the costs and benefits of using secured debt to possibly fund the acquisition of Bennett Building, improvements to other buildings, or potential of re-use of buildings for economic development opportunities.

### *Develop Underutilized Land and Buildings:*

- Secure funding to conduct an inventory of all parcels within the Village that are suitable for new residential or commercial development. This inventory should include size of parcel, owner, and barriers to development such as wetlands and current zoning. Contact owners of parcels to discuss potential development or their future plans. Special attention should be given to the south side industrial area.
- Conduct a review of the zoning code to ensure that it properly balances the needs for protecting current land uses and encouraging new development that is compatible with community values and the strategic master plan. Discuss any needed amendments with Village Council, the Planning Commission and our Villager Planner.
- Develop a cost-effective plan to redevelop the Village's commercial district, located south of the Memorial Shoreway, converting it from a community liability to an asset.
- Engage in discussions with developers, real estate brokers or other professionals to ascertain input as to specific items needed to encourage future development. Assist owners interested in development to connect with developers or builders if needed.
- Most new businesses are small with one or two owners. Depending on the outcome of the facilities plan, the Village may use one of its available buildings as an incubator to cultivate and encourage new start-up businesses, especially in the area of high-tech. There are many examples of successful incubators in the Northeast Ohio and their structure should be reviewed and possibly replicated.
- Explore and evaluate the opportunities and impact that a community development corporation might have on Bratenahl. Identify a resident or group of residents with expertise in the field of creating a CDC or NDC to begin discussions on the requirements, goals and expectations of this new arm of the Village

### *Continue to Maintain Housing Stock:*

- Continue to implement the Village's ongoing exterior housing inspection program.
- Continue to build upon the dialogue already underway with the Cuyahoga County Department of Development Housing Section regarding the County's Home Rehabilitation Loans which allows homeowners to make repairs for below market interest rates, and the Weatherization Assistance Program to assistance homeowners in making their houses as energy efficient. Hold a community meeting to inform the residents of these programs with a representative of the County attending as a resource.
- Use volunteers as in BSAT's Neighbor 2 Neighbor Outreach and the Building Department to serve as a local contact for residents.
- Engage in discussions with the Heritage Home Program. Specialists working in the program answer home maintenance and rehabilitation questions and provide technical assistance when repairs are needed.
- Engage in dialogue and research the state of Ohio's Development Services Agency's Ohio Historic Preservation Tax Credit Program and the Ohio Historic Preservation Tax Credit Pipeline Pilot Initiative.



- Secure funding to conduct an inventory to determine if additional homes should be added to the National Register in order to maintain the unique architectural styles for the future.

***Maintain and Improve Public Infrastructure:***

- Develop a long term capital improvement plan that sets infrastructure and public service priorities for the future and identifies how this plan will be funded.
- Align future Village Hall work efforts with this capital improvement plan to ensure that the plan is followed and implemented.
- Continue the Village’s ongoing street and sewer maintenance plan.
- Pursue alternate revenue sources, such as partnering with Cuyahoga County, ODOT or funding for the Department of Ohio Public Works Committee (DOPWIC). The Village has received DOPWIC zero interest loans for the rebuilding of eight side streets and accompanying infrastructure.

***Natural Environment - Continue to Protect the Village's Natural Environment***

One of the valuable assets of the Village is its natural environment. Being located on the shores of Lake Erie with healthy wooded natural areas throughout the Village is a unique quality for the community. Efforts over the years to preserve and enhance the natural environment have been identified as a key reason many residents live in the community. While public access the lakefront is limited, views of the Lake are abundant. The Village has a responsibility to steward its natural resources. Residents want to live in a green environment that has attractive and healthy environmental assets. At the same time, cost realities must be taken into consideration to ensure that environmental improvements are affordable. By virtue of its historical endowments, Bratenahl has a valuable natural environment, including its lakefront, trees, conserved areas, streams, and wildlife population.

***Natural Environment Action Items:***

- Ensure that current environmental improvement projects are completed in a way that benefits the community.
- Work with key regional environmental organizations to link Bratenahl’s natural resources to those in the surrounding area.
- Identify longer-term ways in which the community can become energy efficient and environmentally sustainable.
- Obtain and use the tree canopy inventory recently created for the Cuyahoga County Planning Commission by a professional environmentalist to complement the public right of way tree inventory maintained by the Village Shade Tree Commission.
- Work with the Ohio Department of Natural Resources Coastal Management Division to conduct an annual inventory of the lakefront and its condition. The Service Director and Village Engineer should monitor any change in condition from year to year. If the condition of the shoreline, erosion, pollutants or other factors change, it is imperative that the Service Director contact the appropriate professional agency or individual for assistance in dealing with the situation. The Cuyahoga County Board of Health, Soil & Water Conservation Agency, or the US Army Core of Engineers are just some of the qualified specialists that may be of assistance to the Village when dealing with the lakefront.

- Continue to support the activities of the BSAT by investigating grant opportunities to secure needed funds or volunteers for designated projects.

### *Community Image - Attract New Residents through Community Marketing*

As communities in Northeast Ohio compete for new residents, Bratenahl needs find opportunities to attract new residents and businesses to the community. The Village should look to create a clear and well-crafted message of its values and amenities. This can be done through improving the visual character of the community and creating marketing plan for attracting new residents and businesses

### *Community Image Action Items:*

- Ensure that the community is safe, attractive, accessible, and appealing.
- Develop a strategy to attract empty nesters and young professionals to the community.
- Work closely with realtors, property owners, and homeowner associations to ensure that the community achieves its new resident attraction goals, and target key multiplier groups (e.g. hospitals, universities, major corporations) in the region.
- Mobilize existing residents to help identify prospective future home buyers.
- Prepare and issue a “Request for Proposal” to solicit a public relations firm that can create a starting residential marketing plan for the Village that will attract home buyers and potentially business owners to the community.
- Investigate funding sources to engage the skills of a landscape architect or other professional to develop a plan for the “Gateways” into the community that demonstrate the type of community the Steering Committee and residents envision. This image is one that will “wow” prospective buyers. Gateways can be designed with the creative use of landscaping, signage and possibly public art structures that send the message desired by the community.



### *III. Planning Process*

#### **Planning Process Roadmap**

The Bratenahl Strategic Master Planning Process was accomplished in three sequential steps:

1. **Project Organization** (March-April 2013): During this step, a planning consultant review and selection committee was formed by Village Government to select the most qualified consulting team to assist with the Strategic Master Plan. Environmental Design Group (EDG) of Akron was selected as the most qualified team among the bidders. With the planning consultant on board, a group of citizens was asked by Village Government to serve on the Strategic Master Plan Advisory Committee.
2. **Community Planning** (May-December 2013): During this step, the community was engaged about the plan, inputs were received in a survey and at three major public meetings, research was conducted on key issues facing the community, with citizen input plan priorities were established, action strategies to address these priorities were identified, and the final plan was developed.
3. **Plan Implementation** (December 2013 and Beyond: At its December 18, 2013 meeting, Village Council will be asked to consider adoption of the plan as a framework to guide future decision-making about community improvements and investments. Following an implementation schedule developed by the Plan Advisory Committee, elements will be put into place in 2014, continuing into 2015.

#### **Planning Process**

Citizen engagement and involvement were priorities throughout the planning process, which paid huge dividends in terms of the quality plan emerging from the process. Three open and interactive community meetings were held during the planning process, which were attended by close to 150 residents. Many ideas were shared by residents, which were grouped by their similarities by the consultant and committee into key issue.

Earlier Bratenahl community planning work was reviewed and given consideration during the planning process, including the two earlier Bratenahl Community Future Searches and the sustainable development planning work of the Bratenahl Sustainability Action Team (BSAT). The Future Search team facilitated a three-day preferred futuring process involving the entire Village and eternal partners to develop a vision, principles and key projects. One outcome was to develop a comprehensive Master Plan. This Bratenahl Sustainable Action Team (BSAT) was formed as a result of the 2010 Future Search process. This led to the Northeast Ohio Public Energy Council (NOPEC) funded LED traffic lighting updates, Greenprint Audit and Feasibility Audits which resulted in planning efforts relative to sustainability and potential renewable energy sources for use by the community.

The Future Searches reminded us of the importance of envisioning the community's future and identifying champions within the community to lead implementation-oriented action teams to get results. The BSAT planning effort reminded us of the importance of being a green community and the various interrelated dimensions of community sustainability, including the environmental, social, governance, property and real estate, economic, and financial.

The Master Plan Steering Committee conducted a Web-based community survey in May 2013. The survey generated an 18% response rate with 216 of the Village's 1,197 residents completing the survey. The survey was valuable in gaining inputs from a representative cross-section of the community. Challenges and opportunities facing the community and Bratenahl's strengths and weaknesses were identified and ranked from the survey results. The survey helped to identify initial issues discussed with residents at the public meetings.

Three public meetings were held on May 23, July 25 and September 12 of 2013. All public meetings were advertised by letter, website and efforts of the Engagement Team, who called upon the representatives of each of Homeowners Associations in the Village, neighborhood leaders and others who represent various groups or committees in the community to spread the word. All three meetings were well represented with between 40 and 70+ residents at each meeting.

- Public Meeting #1 set the framework for the Bratenahl Strategic Master Plan and the planning process that was beginning at that point. A project overview was made by the consultants that included previous planning efforts conducted in the Village, "focus themes" that emerged from previous planning efforts, existing conditions data and preliminary survey results were presented to meeting attendees. After the formal presentation, participants gathered into small groups to share and refine their ideas.
- Public Meeting #2 was conducted to gather as much information as possible from meeting participants. "Emerging Themes" were presented, which were developed on the basis of Public Meeting #1 outcomes. Attendees once again participated in small group discussions that were focused on six overarching themes: Environment, Lakefront, Community Capacity, Public Facilities, Development, Community Image.
- At Public Meeting #3, draft goals were shared with the community. Community input was received on the goals, which helped to refine the goals and identify action strategies to address the goals. The fiscal stability and sustainability of the Village was discussed and ideas were shared about a financial forecasting model that would be used to develop projections on future Village Government revenues and expenditures.

A special website was setup by the Committee to provide information about the planning process to residents. Important reports and presentations generated during the planning process were posted on the website, giving residents 24/7 access to this information. The Bratenahl Strategic Master Plan website is located at: [www.bratenahlmasterplan.wordpress.com](http://www.bratenahlmasterplan.wordpress.com)

The Strategic Master Plan Steering Committee met at least monthly, starting in April 2013. At these meetings, community inputs, research findings, and many ideas were considered, discussed and tested for their value to the strategic master plan. In view of all of these inputs, the Committee was successful in reaching a consensus about plan priorities and action strategies.

With the final plan in hand, the Steering Committee will work to ensure that Village leaders, residents, and other stakeholders understand the plan's content and to gain commitments to implement the plan.

Environmental Design Group (EDG), our planning consultant, provided a number of planning, analysis, design, and facilitation contributions to the planning process. As background the team from Environmental Design Group (EDG) was selected as the consultant for this project through a competitive Request for Proposal process by Village Government. EDG has a team of dedicated professionals in various disciplines including civil engineering, landscape architectural, planning, surveying, environmental sciences and construction administration.

## *IV. Community Planning Priorities*

### *Government & Governance - Strengthen Planning, Management, and Finances*

While Bratenahl is a very small community, it must manage its affairs in an increasingly complex world. The Strategic Master Plan provides the community with an opportunity to strengthen government and community capacity.

Leadership, teamwork and public-private partnerships, consistency with community values and strategic investment are essential to plan implementation. The community must strengthen its governmental and community development capacities to implement its plan. Historically, Bratenahl has relied upon the vision and financial resources of its residents to keep the community strong. This vision and these resources will continue to be important, however formal planning and strategic investment are now required to equip the Village to deal the complexities of today's ever-changing world.

This element of the plan ensures that the community accomplishes its plan priorities over time in a cost-effective manner, and in a way in which the benefits of the plan exceed its costs in the short, intermediate and long terms. The cornerstone of government and community capacity is a sustainable fiscal plan that identifies key investments in building community capacity and the funds to accomplish these investments. This financial plan will require the inclusion of all existing public funds used to keep the community strong, additional state and local grants, philanthropic investments, and private contributions.

In addition to this financial plan, Bratenahl's community capacity will grow stronger through partnerships within and outside the community. Within the community, partnerships with local civic groups, homeowner associations and neighborhoods are essential. Externally, partnerships with Cuyahoga County Government, private real estate firms and developers, state and local infrastructure and environmental authorities, surrounding neighborhood organizations, and regional economic development entities are essential.

As a community, we must be able to measure our progress moving forward. Quantitative and qualitative performance measures are needed to achieve this purpose. The ultimate measure is improvement in the community's capacity to plan and execute its plan in a strategic and cost-effective manner, resulting in increased community vitality and quality of life.

#### *Establish a Financial Sustainability Plan*

It is essential that any Strategic Master Plan (SMP) include a Sustainable Financial Plan (SFP) for it to be useful and to have any credibility. The SFP must have a logical and reliable basis for all elements of Sources of Income and Expenditures. The SFP must extend at least through the period of the SMP, recognizing that a financial plan has to be a dynamic document and must be modified as economic and business environments change. The Finance Sub-Committee of the SMP Committee assumed the responsibility of preparing the proposed SFP for approval by the Bratenahl Council with the entire SMP in December 2013.

The basic assumptions used for this proposed SFP are:

- For simplicity's sake all items of income and expense are condensed to a single number. Be assured that each line item was carefully vetted and calculated in a conservative manner to present a creditable projection.
- 2014 Current Budget is the baseline for forward projections. Five prior years of data have been provided to be used as an indicator of future trends. From 2008 to 2012 revenue increased, on average, 8.8% per year, with a low year of 3.4% and a high year of 14.4%. Expenses escalated at a much lower rate until 2013 when a number of one-time expenses pushed expenses significantly higher. Future predictions, on an annual basis, would escalate from 2014 budget at 3% for Income and 3% for Expenditures. These factors have been modified, as noted, on the basis of credible assumptions.

Below is a list of unusual/one time assumptions:

- For the past few years CCA tax receipts have been inflated by large gains, realized by residents, on transactions reported in the Plain Dealer. Those extraordinary receipts are phased out in 2013 and 2014.
- It is assumed that salaries and benefits are increased by 3% each year.
- Big Dig tax receipts will remain throughout the projection.
- The data from 2008 through 2012 are actual and are the basis, with some adjustments, for the future projections.
- The baseline is 2014 and that projection was arrived at in collaboration with Village Administration and the Finance Subcommittee.
- Debt payments are presented as the annual DOPWIC payment and interest and some principle on Greenspace debt which includes bond counsel, legal fees and interest.
- Beginning in 2013 and continuing annually thereafter, is a contribution to a capital fund of \$175,000.

Based on the above assumptions the Forecast through 2018 is presented in Table 1 below.

*Table 1: Preliminary Financial Projections for Village Government*

Bratenahl Financial Sensitivity Analysis - Updated: 10-16-13	2008	2009 Final	2010 Final	2011 Final	2012 Final	2013 Projected	2014 Projected	2015 Projected	2016 Projected	2017 Projected	2018 Projected
	Actual	Actual	Actual	Actual	Actual	Final	Budget	Budget	Budget	Budget	Budget
Beginning Fund Balance		\$122,832	\$360,662	\$633,733	\$638,376	\$1,152,708	\$896,323	\$769,282	\$489,180	\$205,924	(\$80,578)
Revenue Total	\$2,474,484	\$2,760,684	\$2,853,107	\$3,020,421	\$3,454,105	\$3,960,711	\$3,614,691	\$3,568,632	\$3,675,691	\$3,785,961	\$3,899,540
Expenses Total	\$2,709,229	\$2,522,854	\$2,538,311	\$2,864,521	\$2,894,227	\$4,217,096	\$3,741,732	\$3,848,734	\$3,958,946	\$4,072,464	\$4,189,388

<b>Bratenahl Financial Sensitivity Analysis - Updated: 10-16-13</b>	<b>2008</b>	<b>2009 Final</b>	<b>2010 Final</b>	<b>2011 Final</b>	<b>2012 Final</b>	<b>2013 Projected</b>	<b>2014 Projected</b>	<b>2015 Projected</b>	<b>2016 Projected</b>	<b>2017 Projected</b>	<b>2018 Projected</b>
<b>Difference</b>	<b>-\$234,745</b>	<b>\$237,830</b>	<b>\$314,796</b>	<b>\$155,899</b>	<b>\$559,878</b>	<b>(\$256,385)</b>	<b>(\$127,041)</b>	<b>(\$280,102)</b>	<b>(\$283,255)</b>	<b>(\$286,503)</b>	<b>(\$289,848)</b>
<b>Carry Over Funds (5)</b>	<b>\$122,832</b>	<b>\$360,662</b>	<b>\$633,733</b>	<b>\$638,376</b>	<b>\$1,152,708</b>	<b>\$896,323</b>	<b>\$769,282</b>	<b>\$489,180</b>	<b>\$205,924</b>	<b>(\$80,578)</b>	<b>(\$370,427)</b>

As can be seen from the above data, based on the assumptions, Bratenahl is faced with an operating current deficit in 2013. Bratenahl is also fortunate to have managed its finances well in the last decade. To quote a study published in February of last year by Cleveland State's Maxine Goodman Levin College of Urban Affairs "The Village exhibited controlled expenditures throughout the study period" (2002-2010). This fiscal discipline allowed the Village to enter 2013 with a carryover of over \$1,100,000. Some extraordinary expenditures in 2013; debt repayment, ADA compliance construction, web update and others, will reduce that carryover. The positive carryover will persist, given the assumptions, into 2017. Elsewhere in this plan, there is a call for an overall capital assessment and plan, the \$175,000 annual contribution to a fund dedicated to implementing that plan, is necessary and prudent, and must begin now while the Village's finances allow it. It would seem to be a good use of part of the 2013 contribution to begin the assessment process.

The annual deficits in the general fund will, in 2017, entirely consume the carryover. Therefore we, the Village, must begin to plan for increased revenue and/or reduced expenses before the surplus is gone. Some of the steps that could be taken to maintain a surplus:

- Opportunities to develop land in the Village, Community Center, property south of the Shoreway in the commercial district and the Defense Contract Management Agency property
- Increase tax rates
- Reduce expenses, regionalize services, reduce employees
- Residential development
- Retail development

While those are not the only choices and they are not entirely palatable, to do nothing is unacceptable. At some point it will become necessary to consolidate all debt and include new debt for capital needs and other items that the plans will develop. This debt would require a dedicated levy to retire that debt over time outside of the general fund.

Given the inherent risk, of assumptions being incorrect or risks to the economy, it is highly recommended that this financial plan be monitored closely so that alterations can be made in a timely manner in the event of unforeseen circumstances. It is also recommended that a regular, periodic report be made by the Finance Committee to the Council and Administration, to give them the tools needed to act responsibly. It is essential that the Village follows a disciplined and determined approach to ensuring the community thrives and grows.

Footnotes: All references from General Fund, Appropriations, Mayor's Court, & CCA Tax Trend data sheets obtained from Village Hall
1. CCA 2012 to 2018
*Big Dig estimate \$70,000.00
*Extraordinary tax on option exercises reported in the Plain Dealer in 2012 & 2013 those tax receipts are phased out in 2014 & 2015
2. Salary and Benefits increased by 3% in 2013 & 2014 those are also increased by 3% annually throughout
3. Capital fund is created in this presentation with annual \$175,000 contribution in 2013 and continued each year thereafter
4. 75% spent YTD 2013 as of Sept. Budget
5. Carry Over is Reduced by Debt Payments
6. From 2015 revenues increase 3% and expenses increase 3% plus flat \$175,000 annual contribution to capital fund

***Build Government Capacity to Serve Residents***

Currently the Village of Bratenahl employees 57 employees, 24 of which are full-time, working in the following departments: Police, Service, Recreation, Building, Fiscal and Administration. Of the 33 part-time employees, the majority are police officers. The Service Department’s six full-time employees work primarily days, unless weather conditions requires otherwise. The Building Department provides assistance to residents and builders with permits, inspections, and approvals for new constructions, home additions or other improvements. This department also does enforcement of the Zoning and Property Maintenance Codes. The Clerk’s office is the fiscal agent for the Village and handles all required financial duties.

The Steering Committee and residents present at the public meetings often discussed the need to build community and government capacity within the governmental structure. Bratenahl is a statutory Village. On November 5, 2013, residents in the Village narrowly voted down an issue to study a charter form of government. Based on citizen input, this issue may be revisited in the future.

There are many examples of efficient high-capacity local governments using both forms of government. Some of communities utilize services of a professional Village Manager or Director of Administration. Others use additional staff that can perform similar support functions. These are some tools that that a community can use to ensure professional decision making in the running of the day-to-day operations of the Village. Another tool that can be used is to utilize residents to provide services to the community based on their professional skills. For example, residents could provide services that are needed to ensure increased capacity within the government. During the Steering Committee work, residents were exceptionally engaged in the process and offered high-quality information and details. Building on an already established team of volunteers for items such as grant writing or management, environmental issues (BSAT) or recreation will provide a needed component to the community at little or no cost.



### *Built Environment - Strengthen Bratenahl's Built Environment*

Bratenahl's asset base consists of its residential population, built (real estate and infrastructure) environment, tax base, and natural resources. Increased public and private sector investment in the community's built environment will be required to ensure that Bratenahl remains a strong and vital community in the future. Bratenahl is a landlocked community with very limited land available for future development. This makes the redevelopment of the commercial area south of the Shoreway a top community priority.

In the past, Bratenahl has had sufficient resources to keep its built environment relatively strong, with a few exceptions. These exceptions include some of the Village's neighborhoods that need additional investment and the commercial district south of the Shoreway. Public facility investments have been minimized due to lack of funds. The commercial district has two properties that need improvement. The third parcel in this district has been purchased by the Northeast Ohio Regional Sewer District (NEORS) and in the site of the "Big Dig", a project to improve the quality of water in the steams and Lake. This project will continue through 2020 and give the Village income tax revenue from the workers on site. Once that project is complete, there are possibilities to develop this site.

Additional investments in the community's built environment will help prevent a weakening of the property base and a reduction of tax revenues and home values. The financial plan must include all existing public funds used to keep the community strong, additional state and local grants, philanthropic investments, and private contributions. The community must work its way into economic development as a strategy to expand the local base by attracting the right industrial and technology businesses and jobs to Bratenahl's commercial district.

Partners to help support this priority area include Cuyahoga County Government, City of Cleveland, local and regional economic development organizations, private foundations, and area universities and technology organizations. Ultimately the redevelopment must produce greater fiscal benefits than costs to the community, suggesting that the community leverage its resources and make increased use of private and external public dollars.

The starting point is an area redevelopment plan that assesses assets and liabilities and identifies the best development opportunities that will add to the community's quality of life and provide additional tax revenues to the community. Begin work on a vision and plan to redevelop the Village's south side industrial area with short, intermediate and long-term action steps.

Improved public facilities will serve the community's most pressing needs and improved infrastructure and services to keep the community vital. Investment yardsticks and service improvement levels are key metrics. Physical improvement in the area is essential to showcase Bratenahl within the Shoreway corridor.

#### *Improve Public Facilities*

The Village of Bratenahl owns and operates three buildings:

- Village Hall - Village Hall is located at 411 Bratenahl Road. The 11-acre parcel was acquired by the Village in 1975. The current building is in good condition, well-maintained however, internal space is at a premium. The County Fiscal Office values this building and parcel at \$1.1 Million Dollars. All municipal functions are housed at the Village Hall / Police Station except for the Service Department. The building is home to the Police Department, Mayor's Court, Mayor's Office, Building Department and Clerk and Assistant Clerk's office. Village meetings are held at Village Hall, the Community Center and the BBPDC.
- Service Department - The Service Department is located at 52 Garfield Lane at the western end of the Village. This building was acquired by the Village in 1975 and is currently valued by the County Fiscal Office at \$300,000. This facility houses the trucks and other equipment used by the department to provide ice and snow removal, landscaping, repair and maintenance of roadways, pothole repair, tree lawn maintenance and other related functions. The building is in need of improvements and the department requires additional space for salt storage or a collaboration with other governmental entities to improve efficiency.
- Community Center - The Village acquired the old Bratenahl Elementary School in 1989 and currently uses it as a Community Center. The two-acre site is located in a residential neighborhood on Brighton Road with parking access from Burton. The County Fiscal Office values this property at \$1.1 Million. Only minor renovations have been done to the building since the Village acquired it and most of the facility resembles the old school.

The Village is aware of the escalating cost to properly maintain these buildings and lands. On the Community Survey, the question was asked how the residents would rate the quality and function of these public facilities. A significant majority of residents who that responded thought that the public facilities needed to be upgraded or improved.

The Village should prepare a Community Facility Assessment Study for the current facilities and also consider as potential new facilities. A Community Facility Assessment could include both a program assessment to identify how effectively each building is supporting the delivery of services, program, or uses; and a condition assessment to identify condition assessment of the physical conditions and associated costs needed to improve the building to meet its needs. The condition assessment portion could include structural, roofing, mechanical, electrical, and plumbing, fire and life safety, ADA accessibility, technology infrastructure, code violations, and general health and safety conditions. The report would provide conclusions, alternatives, and recommendations for future renovation, addition to, abandonment of, sale of existing or new construction of facilities.

### *Develop Underutilized Land and Property*

During the public process, some residents identified the need for additional retail activity – coffee shops, dry cleaners, etc. While the density of the community, visibility from major roads, and road volume would most likely make it difficult to attract any significant retailer, there could be opportunities for incorporating some local retail in the community. At the same time, there was also strong opposition to encouraging retail in the community.

Parcels that include the community center facility and the Barbara Byrd Bennett site could be opportunities for redevelopment into either residential, commercial or office uses. Whether or not the Village can determine a use for the Barbara Byrd Bennett site, one strategy would be to secure the property from the Cleveland School District and to drive the redevelopment process. As owners, the Village would be able to issue a Request for Proposals from private developers for the redevelopment of the property or pursue its use as a community center. The Village would control the process and use by outlining specific requirements of the redevelopment such as use, density and buffering.

The Defense Contract Management Agency (DCMA) is located at the far western end of the Village. This property was once owned by the Holden family and considered a potential site for the Holden Arboretum. Once a decision was made to locate the Arboretum in Kirtland, the US Navy purchased this property from the Holden family. It was first used as a site for Nike missile facility in the 1960s, later redeveloped into the Navy Finance Center in the late 1970s and 1980s, and then as the DCMA in the 1990s. Governmental contracts are issued from this facility to purchase items for all branches of the US military. Last year alone over \$1.6 billion in contracts emanated from this DCMA. Over 150 individuals are employed here, including DFAS and other agencies, producing significant income tax revenue for the Village. The head of DCMA command is Dayton, Ohio. If the government were to ever abandon this building and multiple acre parcel, the Village could acquire it for development.

Other development opportunities within the Village are the parcels south of I-90. These parcels represent the best opportunity to create additional tax base without disrupting the community character north of the interstate. Three parcels totaling approximately 45 acres are currently owned by three landowners including Northeast Ohio Regional Sewer District owns a majority of the land (24.77 acres) and is using it for construction of a large sewer tunnel project (the "Big Dig"). Once complete in 2020, the parcel may have redevelopment opportunities. Additionally, the 6.97-acre Sign Lite property may be acquired and combined with other adjacent parcels to create a larger more attractive parcel for redevelopment. While the site has very good visibility from Interstate 90, access is a challenge and would need to be evaluated. Currently the parcels are accessed either by Coit Road or East 140th. The NEORSRD has built an access road for use in the construction of the tunnel project and may be an opportunity for access under a redevelopment project. Because of the access, visibility, and zoning, light industrial or office would be the most logical use for the site.

The community can take certain steps to encourage additional residential housing, such as simplifying the existing zoning code to make it flexible for builders and/or developers. Using tools such as Planned Residential Developments (PRD's) and Overlay Districts allows for flexibility in zoning while allowing the project to be economically feasible. The Village can seek out local builders to encourage new residential development in appropriately zoned areas.

Bratenahl can take certain steps to encourage commercial development where appropriate. By offering certain program incentives the Village can encourage commercial development. Some of these incentives include: the Community Reinvestment Program tax abatement, Job Creation Tax Credits and Tax Increment Financing. Reviewing the zoning and building codes to ensure that they are current and flexible may also encourage the development desired by the community if located properly and not impacting our safety.

Village Government and private citizens could create a communitywide development corporation that ensures the Village implements its master plan and has the resources to achieve full plan implementation. Community development corporations are nonprofit, community-based organizations formed by residents, small business owners, faith-based groups, and other local stakeholders to revitalize communities. Some groups cover several counties and provide a spectrum of assistance while others focus on one community and one aspect of community development.

The CDC could take the lead in creating this plan and developing support among key property owners and stakeholders to ensure viable redevelopment can occur. It will be essential for either the Village or the CDC to take control of some of the properties in the area. Other properties should be privately owned. Define future public facility needs in light of the master plan and develop a prudent financial plan to accomplish these priorities over time. Once the public facilities plan has been completed, begin work on a long-term capital improvement/investment plan for the community. If a CDC is created in Bratenahl, the organization should do the following: be established as a 501(c)(3) organization, be self-sustaining (at a minimum) and ideally generate income as an entity. This can be done by fundraising through events, monetary match programs and/or in-kind service donations, receive endowments, donations and grant monies that the Village is unable to receive.

### *Continue to Maintain Housing Stock*

The community contains a variety of housing stock including lakefront homes built by early 20th Century industrialists. The community also has both prewar homes mixed with late 20th century residential housing. The quality of the housing stock represents one of the most commented reasons residents moved to Bratenahl. Residential developments of the 90's added new units and new tax base to the Village and consumed much of the vacant land for development. Currently, the Village has mostly small isolated development parcels with the exception of the DCMA facility owned by the Department of the Navy and property south of Interstate 90 located in the commercial district.

Bratenahl has an extensive collection of historically significant homes, each with unique architectural styles that should be preserved in order to maintain the community's unique character. Residents should be encouraged, and in some case incentivized, to do so. There are several programs available to the Village that can assist with not only maintaining their homes, but doing so to maintain the original style. The first program is the Heritage Home Program, which is a resource for homes that are over 50 years old. Specialists working in the program answer home maintenance and rehabilitation questions and provide technical assistance when repairs are needed. Houses do not need to be on the historical register to be eligible for this free assistance. More information can be found at the Heritage Home Program website at [www.heritagehomeprogram.org](http://www.heritagehomeprogram.org). The second program that is available to residents throughout the state of Ohio is through the Development Services Agency (DSA). This agency sponsors the Ohio Historic Preservation Tax Credit Program which provides a 25% tax credit for rehabilitation expenses to owners and lessees of historically significant buildings. A building must be on the list of National Register of Historic Places in order to receive this tax credit. This program is competitive and accepts applications bi-annually.

Along the same line as the Ohio Historic Preservation Tax Credit Program, the DSA has introduced a pilot program called the Ohio Historic Preservation Tax Credit Pipeline Pilot Initiative. This new program will provide small grants to help cities or individuals in the process to nominate a building or district to the National Register. It will also provide small grants to determine rehabilitation projects for the home. The goal of this pilot program is to create a pipeline of properties that are eligible for the traditional Historic Preservation Tax Credit Program. Currently there are four homes in Bratenahl included on the National Register of Historical Places. They are: Gwinn Estate at 12407 Lake Shore Boulevard; Howard M. Hanna, Jr. House at 11505 Lake Shore Boulevard; Jay M. Pickands House at 9619 Lake Shore Boulevard; Taylor Mansion – Lakehurst at 193 Bratenahl Road.

### *Maintain and Improve Public Infrastructure*

Maintaining and improving public infrastructure is a sound investment in any community. The Village should continue its ongoing street and sewer maintenance plan. It should also pursue alternate revenue sources, such as partnering with Cuyahoga County. ODOT or funding from the Department of Ohio Public Works Committee (DOPWIC) can be used to upgrade and replace aging infrastructure. The Village has received DOPWIC zero interest loans for the rebuilding of eight side streets and accompanying infrastructure.

In addition, the Village should develop a long term capital improvement plan that sets infrastructure and public service priorities for the future and identifies how this plan will be funded. Capital investment planning (CAP) is essential to building a stable and vital community. Bratenahl needs a long-term capital investment plan that identifies future major facility and infrastructure needs. A financial plan to accomplish these capital investments must be developed as part of the Sustainable Financial Plan (SFP). The CAP should focus on major infrastructure improvements (not routine maintenance) renovations to existing facilities, construction of new facilities, and acquiring and repurposing new facilities.

Key priorities for the CAP include:

1. Resurfacing Lakeshore Boulevard
2. Any proposed community gateways improvements.
3. Public facility improvements and acquisitions identified in the SMP.
4. Infrastructure improvements necessary to redevelop the south side industrial property.
5. Major new equipment, vehicle, and technology purchases and leases.
6. Environmental improvements and conservation investments.

The CAP should use the same economic, financial, and demographic assumptions used for the SMP and SFP.

## *Natural Environment - Continue to Protect the Village's Natural Environment*

Bratenahl appears as a green island within a surrounding concrete fabric. The community is home to one of the few remaining mature forests along the Cleveland area Lake Erie coastline. Bratenahl has maintained a healthy ecological balance between its natural canopy of woodlands and stream systems as they flow to Lake Erie. Previous conservation efforts continue to protect critical riparian stream systems and woodlands.

Residents have regularly commented that the importance of the natural environment defines the character and quality of their community. Consistently throughout the public planning process, the environmental stewardship was identified as a valuable asset that the community wanted to protect, conserve, and enhance. Continued efforts to maintain a healthy tree canopy should be carried forward in the future. Tree preservation efforts could include zoning code protection or reforestation efforts.

The Village has a responsibility to steward its natural resources. Residents want to live in a green environment that has attractive and healthy environmental assets. At the same time, cost realities must be taken into consideration to ensure that environmental improvements are affordable. By virtue of its historical endowments, Bratenahl has a valuable natural environment, including its lakefront, trees, conserved areas, streams, and wildlife population.

Environmental improvements add to property values when done in the proper manner. The Village must continue to work with external agencies to ensure that the environment is protected in a cost-effective manner. Outside and private financial resources should be identified to aid in providing future revenues to make ongoing improvements. Partners such as the Northeast Ohio Regional Sewer District, Cuyahoga County Government, private conservation groups, private citizens, State of Ohio and Federal agencies concerned with natural resource and the environment will play a key part in these matters.

The community should continue to work with these agencies and organizations to protect and restore the natural riparian areas of Nine Mile Creek and Dugway Creek. This includes evaluating the channels for stream bank stabilization, invasive species control, and riparian re-vegetation. Acknowledging staffing capacity issues, the Village should continue to work with the resident grant writing volunteers, the BSAT committee and other agencies and organizations on assisting in these efforts, including identifying funding sources for these preservation and restoration efforts.

The Village has been engaged in maintaining, preserving and protection the natural environment for many years. Several of the activities include:

- Establishing an Ad-Hoc Committee named the Bratenahl Sustainability Action Team (BSAT) that has worked hard to provide guidance and direction to the Village to protect all aspects of the natural environment.

- Due to the National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System (NDEPS) by the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) requirements, the community has been engaged in protection the Nine Mile stream and checking outfalls as required. The condition of the stream and impact to Lake Erie has been under constant scrutiny and any improvements that need to be made are immediately handled by the Village.
- Working with the Shade Tree Commission's mission to monitor, maintain and protect the trees in the public right-of-way.
- Completion of the NEORS "Big Dig" in a way that positively impacts the community. Environmental assessment of the south side industrial area. Continued cleanup of the three streams running through the community and protection of the Village's forested areas and conserved lands.



## *Community Image - Attract New Residents through Community Marketing*

Bratenahl is an aging community from the standpoint of its demographics, housing stock, and public infrastructure. The Village lost 10% of its residential base during 2000-2010. With its population base growing older in line with regional demographic trends, and also because it has not attracted a sufficient number of younger residents to offset its older population. The private wealth base and tax base of the community will decline if a concerted effort is not made to attract the next generation of empty nester and young professional residents. It must attract new younger residents (young professionals and empty nesters) to replace those it is losing.

A marketing strategy aimed at attracting residents with economic means will help make up for expected future losses. A strategically planned marketing campaign is critical to the future of a thriving community. A community marketing strategy is step one, which must be followed by a multi-level marketing campaign (personal contact/outreach, web-based, print material and video) that strengthens Bratenahl's relationships throughout the region. Caution: Do not overspend on expensive glossy print materials or videos!

There are a variety of strategies that can be implemented to ensure the positive features of Bratenahl are promoted to the right targeted segment of any new population to the Village. A marketing plan means sending the right message about the community to potential home buyers and prospective businesses. The community needs to send the message that they are serious about the Village's economic future and are willing to do the work to make itself more attractive and a profitable place to grow a business. Partners in this effort should include residential realtors, homeowner associations and neighborhoods, residents with connections to the area's major healthcare, university, and corporate employers, and local civic organizations. New resident attraction is the primary metric, but home sales and price levels are close second metrics. Charting improvement in the community's image is a qualitative metric to be instituted.

Key elements of the community marketing strategy should include:

1. A marketing brand that fits Bratenahl in the future.
2. Clear resident retention and attraction objectives with annual performance metrics.
3. Training and use of current residents as community ambassadors.
4. New section on Village Government's website on community marketing.
5. Encourage homeowners associations and other in-town communities to coordinate their marketing efforts with an overall community marketing campaign. Invite their ideas and assistance
6. Form a community marketing team that includes representation from all Village homeowner associations, neighborhoods, Village Government, Bratenahl Community Foundation, Shoreby Club, realtors serving the community, area businesses doing business in the community (interior designers, construction companies, restaurants, bankers and mortgage companies, etc.)
7. Improved Web-based information about available residential real estate in the community.
8. Outreach strategy to major healthcare institutions, corporations, and institutions to develop new resident leads.
9. In-reach strategy to existing residents to ensure they are satisfied living in the community.

10. Inexpensive but high quality print literature that can be easily and frequently updated about the community and residential opportunities.
11. Testimonials from existing residents about their positive experiences living in the community. These should be representative of new residents to be attracted.
12. Create a buzz about Bratenahl through social media and involvement in regional civic groups like University Circle Inc., Downtown Development Alliance, COSE, Greater Cleveland Partnership, and the Cleveland Leadership Center.
13. A cost-effective advertising strategy about living in Bratenahl aimed at major magazines and arts and cultural institutions (e.g. the Orchestra)

## *V. Existing Community Conditions Overview*

### *Community History*

Bratenahl, originally part of East Cleveland Township, was a fruit and vegetable farming area during the mid-19th century, which included the Charles Bratenahl family farm, located along the lakeshore at the road that today bears the family's name. By the early 1870's, Charles Coit had built a summer hotel on Eddy Road at the lakeshore, named Coit House. In 1889 this property became a membership-only country club and added a golf course in 1895. The club was frequented by a number of Cleveland's wealthy families, who began to come to the lakeshore during the summertime in the second half of the 19th century. Living first in elaborately furnished tents and later in summer cottages, many of the families subsequently built large mansions on the lakefront. Bratenahl is dominated by Lake Shore Boulevard, a curving, tree-lined road flanked by elegant homes and estates with rolling lawns, elaborate landscapes and gardens, delineated with picturesque walls and fences.

At the turn of the 20th century, the current Bratenahl was part of the villages of Glenville and Collinwood. In 1903, when Glenville was annexed into Cleveland, a group of residents who opposed the merger formed the new Village of Bratenahl, encompassing land north of the Lake Shore & Michigan Southern Railroad line, extending from Gordon Park east to Coit Road. Later, in 1906, when the Village of Collinwood was annexed into Cleveland, a similar swath of land north of the railroad line from Coit Road east to East 140th Street were added to Bratenahl. The population in Bratenahl remained small during the early 20th century, rising from 690 (1910) to 1,000 (1920) to 1,308 (1930). (Source: Cuyahoga County Planning Commission, August 2007.)

### *Regional Context*

Currently Bratenahl occupies a 1.6 square mile area on the shores of Lake Erie and it is surrounded on the west, south and east by the city of Cleveland and Lake Erie to the north. The Village is just east of Downtown Cleveland. Bratenahl is an upscale village known for its large homes with a unique architectural style. Incorporated in 1905 as a summer place for wealthy residents of Cleveland, the Village has maintained its housing stock and exemplary services to its 700 households.

In the past, Bratenahl was known for its stately mansions. It now offers a variety of housing options, including high-rise luxury condominiums, single-family homes, cluster homes and a lakefront community. Close proximity to Downtown on I-90 allows a quick commute of just 10 to 15 minutes for most residents. Easy access to the University Circle, known for its museums, Severance Hall, which is the home of the Cleveland Orchestra, and world-renowned medical facilities make living in Bratenahl a highly desirable community.

### *Natural Environment*

Lakefront: Much of the reason Bratenahl has remained an attractive location is its location along Lake Erie. The lakefront represents the most important natural resource in the community. While most of the lakefront is owned by private landowners, there is a location at the northern end of Bratenahl Road that provides an open view of the Lake. Bratenahl has approximately 2.5 miles of lakefront of which a

majority is owned by private land owners. While public access to the lakefront is limited, the Village has numerous views of the lake. The northern extension of Bratenahl Road provides an opportunity for public access to views of the lake even though access to the water would be limited to the existing bluff. While many residents and stakeholders acknowledged the importance of the physical connection to the lake, there were concerns about safety, security, and resources needed to create, maintain, and support public access. In addition, there are limited opportunities for public access. The Village has, in the past, evaluated opportunities to create parks and open space.

Tree Canopy: Bratenahl has a significant tree canopy of mature woodlands especially compared to adjacent Cleveland neighborhoods. These beautiful mature trees provide not only a visual amenity, also provides economic and environmental benefits to the community. Tree canopy and mature trees have been noted in research to protect and increase land values. From an environmental perspective, tree canopies assist in reducing storm water runoff, provide shade that reduces energy usage, and provide habitat including critical bird migration locations. Other benefits include carbon sequestration, public health improvements, and wind protection.

Stream & Riparian System: Bratenahl has three streams that traverse the Village: Ninemile Creek; Shaw Brook and Dugway Creek. All empty into natural channels from culverts as they enter the Village before the confluence at the Lake. These streams show signs of degradation because of upstream conditions of volume, intensity, and water quality. Both streams are culverted for long distances upstream in Cleveland neighborhoods and have limited opportunities for natural day lighting upstream. Despite these urban conditions, they represent a valuable natural resource not only to Bratenahl but to all of Northeastern Ohio.

Conservation Areas: Bratenahl has done a successful job of protecting critical environmental areas of the Village. The village owns approximately 20 acres of conserved land. Residents have also conserved another 35 acres. Included in those conserved lands are the former Dale/Ross property, now called the Bratenahl Green Space Preserve, and the former Roediger property, now called the Bratenahl Bird Sanctuary.

### *Demographics*

As of the 2010 Census, Bratenahl has 1,197 residents living in the Village. This is down 140 residents (10.47%) since the 2000 census. In comparison, the City of Cleveland currently has 396,830 residents (down 17.05%) and Cuyahoga County has 1,280,122 residents (down 8.17%).

One major demographic difference that distinguishes Bratenahl from the City of Cleveland and Cuyahoga County is the ‘adult to child ratio’. Bratenahl has 14.35 adults to every child, while Cleveland has 3.06 and Cuyahoga County has 3.41. This is most likely due to the fact the Bratenahl does not have its own school system and only 3.9% of families living in Bratenahl have (their own) children under the age of 18. The Village has approximately between 15 to 18% of its population that have homes in warmer climates as their primary residences. They pay property tax on the homes they own in Bratenahl but do not pay local income tax to the Village.

The median family income in the Village has grown 6.36% from the year 2000 (\$104,987) to 2010 (\$111,667). In comparison, the median family income State of Ohio has grown 18.07% from \$50,037 in 2000 to \$59,080 in 2010. Bratenahl's mean income in 2010 is \$180,473 and in actual dollars, is substantially more than the State of Ohio which has a mean income of \$59,680 in 2010. The percent increase from the year 2000 to 2010 is dramatically different. The State of Ohio's mean income increased by 20.57% while the Village of Bratenahl only increased 0.06%.

***Workforce Residing in Bratenahl***

According to the Census Bureau, 574 of Bratenahl's 1,179 residents were employed in the workforce in 2011, compared to 648 in 2002. These 574 working residents include 292 employed women and 282 employed men. Of those now in the workforce, 84 (14.6%) are age 29 or younger, 254 (44.3%) are age 30-54, and 236 (41.1%) are age 55 or older. Over 22% of those in the workforce are employed in jobs in the healthcare and social assistance sector, 12.5% in educational services, 7.8% in Professional, Scientific, and Technical Services, 7.5% in public administration, and the other 51.2% are employed in a wide variety of industries.

Of the 574 currently working residents, 556 (96.6%) work outside of Bratenahl. Only 18 (3.1%) both live and work in Bratenahl. Finally, 206 people work in Bratenahl; 188 (91.3%) of which live outside Bratenahl. Table below shows where working Bratenahl residents work. By far, the City of Cleveland is the employment location for the largest number of working Bratenahl residents (306 of the 574 or 53.3% of the total). Other key employment locations include Euclid, Solon, Beachwood, Independence, Mayfield Heights, Brooklyn, Cleveland Heights, and Eastlake. Interestingly, the number of residents who are employed as declined from 648 in 2002 to 574 in 2011. Retirement and job loss are the two major reasons accounting for this drop.

*Table 2: Bratenahl's Residential Workforce*

<b>Where Working Bratenahl Residents Work, 2011</b>				
	<b>2011</b>		<b>2002</b>	
	<b>Count</b>	<b>Share</b>	<b>Count</b>	<b>Share</b>
Total	<b>574</b>	<b>100%</b>	<b>648</b>	<b>100%</b>
Cleveland city, OH	306	53.3%	323	49.8%
Euclid city, OH	23	4.0%	27	4.2%
Bratenahl village, OH	18	3.1%	20	3.1%
Solon city, OH	18	3.1%	7	1.1%
Beachwood city, OH	14	2.4%	23	3.5%
Independence city, OH	12	2.1%	11	1.7%
Mayfield Heights city, OH	12	2.1%	9	1.4%

Where Working Bratenahl Residents Work, 2011				
	2011		2002	
Brooklyn city, OH	10	1.7%	7	1.1%
Cleveland Heights city, OH	8	1.4%	7	1.1%
Eastlake city, OH	8	1.4%	5	0.8%
All Other Locations	145	25.3%	209	32.3%

Source: U.S. Census Bureau, Longitudinal Employment and Household Dynamics Data

Note: These numbers relate to the active working population in the community.

### *Road Network*

Lakeshore Boulevard is the main thoroughfare within the Village. It is an east/west roadway that extends across the entire width of the Village. Bratenahl Road, Eddy Road and E. 140th Street are the main north/south roadways within the Village. Residents and visitors to Bratenahl can access I-90 at Eddy Road and the Lakeshore Boulevard on/off ramp just west of Lakeshore Drive. The only traffic count done recently in the Village was traffic flow through the intersection of Lakeshore Boulevard and Eddy Road. This study, done in 2002, showed an ADT of 7,000 cars in a 24 hour period. Just east of the Village border, Lakeshore Boulevard has an ADT (average daily traffic) count of 6,540 cars per day. Interstate 90 averages 130,000 cars per day within the Bratenahl Village limits.

### *Sidewalk Inventory*

Bratenahl is well connected by sidewalks along major public roads. The map to the left shows the Northeast Ohio Areawide Coordinating Agency (NOACA) sidewalk inventory for the Village. Green lines represent roadways that have sidewalks on both sides of the street. Blue lines represent areas that have partial sidewalks along one side of the street. Red lines show roadways that do not have any sidewalks. There are no major public roadways within the Village of Bratenahl that have missing sidewalks. Lakeshore Boulevard has a partial sidewalk on the north side of the street and all major north/south public roads within the Village have complete sidewalks on both sides of the street. All sidewalks in the Village have been replaced during the last dozen years.

### *Bicycle Facilities*

Given the low traffic volumes around the Village on local roads, it is assumed that Bratenahl also has low traffic volumes. Roadways with less than 10,000 cars per day are ideal for bicyclists to ride on the roadway, whether bike lanes are present or not. Bicycle counts are not available within the Village limits. The blue lines shown in the map to the right represent NOACA regional priority bikeway routes and indicate that the identified roadway is part of a larger regional bicycle route network. Lakeshore Boulevard is identified as a regional priority bicycle route and is part of the Cleveland Lakefront Bikeway/Lake Erie Coastal Ohio Trail. This means that the Village needs to provide for safe accommodations for cyclists along Lakeshore Boulevard if federal funds are ever used to improve the roadway in the future. At a minimum, appropriate on-road bicycle signage with "sharrows" (shared lane markings with painted arrows and an outline of a bicycle on

the pavement) should be installed. Future bike lanes and/or trails along Lakeshore Boulevard would need to be addressed via a multi-model transportation study along the boulevard.

*Transit*

Lakeshore Boulevard is a main bus route within the Greater Cleveland Regional Transit Authority (GCRTA) transit network. Route #39 runs and stops along Lakeshore Boulevard with the Village of Bratenahl. The route begins at Public Square in Downtown Cleveland and takes riders to Euclid Hospital at East 185th Street and the Shoregate Shopping Center in Willowick, Ohio in Lake County. Route #39 is a weekday route that runs from 6:05am to 6:50pm. Riders can easily connect from Route #39 in the Village to Routes 39F, 239 and 30.